

COMMISSION ACTION

NCPC File No. 6132



PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE IN FRONT OF THE WHITE HOUSE SECURITY AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

PRELIMINARY SITE AND BUILDING PLANS

Pennsylvania Avenue between 15TH and 17TH Streets, NW, and
Jackson and Madison Places, NW,
Washington, DC

Submission by the Federal Highway Administration

June 5, 2003

Commission Action Requested by Applicant

Approval of the preliminary site and building plans pursuant to 40 U.S.C. §8722(d) and Section 5 of the National Capital Planning Act (40 U.S.C. § 8722(b)(1)).

Commission Action

The Commission:

- Approves the preliminary site and building plans (security and landscape design) for Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House (between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, including Jackson and Madison Places), Washington, DC, as shown on NCPC Map File No. 1.31(38.00)41140;
- **Requests** that the following details be addressed as the project proceeds to final design:
 - ◇ Refinement of the paving pattern to ensure:
 - the colors of the granite sidewalk complement the adjacent buildings, fence walls and piers along the Avenue.
 - the color of the granite cartway clearly define the curb's edge, and handicap ramps.
 - the design of the aggregate paving complements the granite selection while reinforcing the relationship of the street to the open lawn of the White House grounds and Lafayette Park.
 - the perimeter cross walk locations are well delineated.

- ◇ Refinement of the cap design of the fixed and removable bollards on Pennsylvania Avenue (Pennsylvania Avenue bollard) to discourage improper use, such as sitting or standing.
- ◇ Refinement of the security booth to ensure the proper proportion of its granite base, columns, and roof to reduce the perceived mass of the structure, as well as the booth's impact on views approaching the Avenue and through Lafayette Park. Additionally, ensure that the roof does not encroach into the travel route of the parade.
- ◇ Removal of the four white masonry bollards at the terminus of Jackson and Madison Places at H Street.
- ◇ Amend the inner barrier line at 15th Street to extend the bollards across the sidewalk to the bottom of the steps, aligned with the column located west of Riggs' Bank entry, eliminating the benches as part of the security barrier.
- ◇ Refine how the area between the outer security line on Pennsylvania Avenue at 17th Street and the proposed location of the modified bollard line on 17th Street, along the Eisenhower Executive Office Building (EEOB) fence is hardened.
- ◇ Amend the tree planting scheme to remove the three trees in front of Riggs bank and the two trees in front of the Renwick Gallery; and refine the spacing of the street trees and the placement of benches in relation to the built features along the Avenue.

Deborah B. Young
Secretary to the National Capital Planning Commission

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

NCPC File No. 6132



PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE IN FRONT OF THE WHITE HOUSE SECURITY AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS PRELIMINARY SITE AND BUILDING PLANS

Pennsylvania Avenue between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, and
Jackson and Madison Places, NW,
Washington, DC

Submission by the Federal Highway Administration
May 29, 2003

Abstract

In March 2003, the National Capital Planning Commission adopted the concept design for Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House which called for landscape and security improvements to this important place. In accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA), on April 26, 2003, the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) released an Environmental Assessment (EA) on the proposed improvements to Pennsylvania Avenue. On May 5, FHWA held a public meeting to discuss the NEPA document and historic preservation issues, and on May 19, FHWA held another public consultation meeting to further discuss historic preservation issues in accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. These meetings provided an opportunity for adjacent property owners, stakeholders, and the public to comment on the design proposal. The design team has considered all input received to date, and begun detailed design. Further design refinement will continue to resolve any outstanding issues and finalize the design of the site furnishings and materials.

The proposed design will replace the temporary security components on Pennsylvania Avenue and on Jackson and Madison Places (erected in 1995 after the Oklahoma City bombing); and it will improve the quality of President's Park. The beauty, civic design and visual quality of this special place in the Nation's Capital will be improved with the design and construction of architecturally pleasing security booths and bollards, street tree planting, paving materials, and street furniture, such as benches and lighting. This effort, managed by the Federal Highway Administration, has resulted in a preliminary design that successfully addresses the operational requirements of the various users of the Avenue and Lafayette Square, and several key criteria, including satisfying existing security requirements; reflecting a clear memory of the Avenue's historic use; accommodating the Downtown Circulator and staging of the Inaugural Parade; and allowing for the future reopening of the street to vehicular traffic.

Commission Action Requested by Applicant

Approval of the preliminary site and building plans pursuant 40 U.S.C. §8722(d) and Section 5 of the National Capital Planning Act (40 U.S.C. §8722(b)(1)).

Executive Director's Recommendation

The Commission:

- **Approves** the preliminary site and building plans (security and landscape design) for Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House (between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, including Jackson and Madison Places), Washington DC, as shown on NCPC Map File No.1.31(38.00)41140;
- **Requests that** the following details be addressed as the project proceeds to final design:
 - Refinement of the paving pattern to ensure:
 - the colors of the granite sidewalk complement the adjacent buildings, fence walls and piers along the Avenue.
 - the color of the granite cartway clearly defines the curb's edge, and handicap ramps.
 - the design of the aggregate paving complements the granite selection while reinforcing the relationship of the street to the open lawn of the White House grounds and Lafayette Park.
 - the perimeter cross walk locations are well delineated.
 - Refinement of the cap design of the new fixed and removable bollards on Pennsylvania Avenue (Pennsylvania Avenue bollard) to discourage improper use, such as sitting or standing.
 - Refinement of the security booth to ensure the proper proportion of its granite base, columns, and roof to reduce the perceived mass of the structure, as well as the booth's impact on views approaching the Avenue and through Lafayette Park. Additionally, ensure that the roof does not encroach into the travel route of the parade.
 - Removal of the four white masonry bollards at the terminus of Jackson and Madison Places at H Street.
 - Amend the inner barrier line at 15th Street to extend the bollards across the sidewalk to the bottom of the steps, aligned with the column located west of Riggs' Bank entry, eliminating the benches as part of the security barrier.
 - Refine how the area between the outer security line on Pennsylvania Avenue at 17th Street and the proposed location of the modified bollard line on 17th Street, along the

Eisenhower Executive Office Building (EEOB) fence is hardened.

- Amend the tree planting scheme to remove the three trees in front of Riggs Bank and the two trees in front of the Renwick Gallery; and refine the spacing of the street trees and the placement of benches in relation to the built features along the Avenue.

* * *

BACKGROUND AND STAFF EVALUATION

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Project Location

The proposed project is located in President's Park on Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House, between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, and includes both Jackson and Madison Places, adjacent to Lafayette Park. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figure 1*) The project area encompasses:

Pennsylvania Avenue: the entire length of the north and south sidewalks.

Madison Place: the east sidewalk, it excludes the west sidewalk along Lafayette Park except for those areas necessary to connect with the existing bollard line in Lafayette Park.

Jackson Place: the west sidewalk, it excludes the east sidewalk along Lafayette Park except for those areas necessary to connect with the existing bollard line in Lafayette Park.

Background Summary

In May 1995, Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House was closed to public vehicular traffic. A White House security review concluded that no alternatives existed to ensure the protection of the President and others in the White House from explosive devices, except by prohibiting vehicular traffic on the Avenue. On November 1 2001, after lengthy study and consideration, the National Capital Planning Commission adopted a report recommended by the Interagency Security Task Force, entitled "Designing for Security in the Nation's Capital."

Based on legitimate security concerns, the report recommends that Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House remain closed to normal city traffic at this time. If in the future, there are major positive changes in the security environment and/or risk detection technology is improved to the satisfaction of the relevant government agencies, this recommendation will be reconsidered by the National Capital Planning Commission.

Recognizing that the present condition of the street and its crudely barricaded security checkpoints are unacceptable, the report recommended the immediate design and construction of a landscaped civic space along the Pennsylvania Avenue fight-of-way in front of the White House to create a distinguished, pedestrian-oriented space appropriate for the Nation's Capital. The recommendation also included the following general design and programmatic criteria:

- Respect and enhance the historic setting and views of the White House.
- Reflect a clear memory of Pennsylvania Avenue's historic use.
- Accommodate the staging of the Inaugural Parade.
- Accommodate the Downtown Circulator.
- Allow for the future reopening of the street to vehicular traffic.
- Allow for the possible future construction of a tunnel.

Existing Conditions

(Refer to Attachment I, Figure 2)

Pennsylvania Avenue, between 15th and 17th Streets, and Jackson and Madison Places have been limited to pedestrians, bicyclists, and authorized vehicles since interim security measures were installed in 1995. These measures include large concrete planters (located on the street and across the sidewalks), security booths, and hydraulic plate barriers. The current condition restricts views and pedestrian movement, and mars the beauty and dignity of this important place in the Nation's Capital. In 1999, decorative bollards were installed as a security measure in the northern portion of Lafayette Park, including Jackson and Madison Places to improve both security and aesthetic conditions.

The United States Secret Service (USSS) manages the entry portals to this precinct. The entry portals on Pennsylvania Avenue at 15th and 17th Streets serve as the primary security checkpoints and the entry portals from H Street at Jackson and Madison Places serve as the secondary security checkpoints.

Pennsylvania Avenue is an 84-foot-wide asphalt roadway with a 33-foot-wide concrete sidewalk along the south side of the Avenue (White House side). On the north side of the Avenue, a 16-foot-wide concrete sidewalk is located in front of the Riggs Bank and Bank of America; an 18-foot-wide brick sidewalk is located in front of the Renwick Gallery and Blair House; and a 21-foot-wide brick sidewalk is located along Lafayette Park. Jackson and Madison Places are 40-foot wide roadways with residential-scale brick sidewalks on each side. The width of these walks ranges between 17 and 19 feet. Jackson Place currently accommodates 40 angled parking spaces adjacent to the park.

A single row of street trees lines each curb, except for the portion of Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House between East and West Executive Drives. A row of Elm trees once lined the sidewalk in front of the White house, but these trees succumbed to Dutch Elm Disease in the mid-twentieth century. Large concrete bollards replaced the former tree row in 1988. Overall, the existing trees along the Avenue vary in age and size and, in places, are unevenly spaced.

Different styles of cast iron light poles are installed along the sidewalks on Pennsylvania Avenue and along Lafayette Park, and some are used to post street and way-finding signage. Benches are located on the sidewalks around Lafayette Park, and there are several benches and way-finding kiosks at the entry portals at 15th and 17th Streets.

Although title rests with the United States, Pennsylvania Avenue, between 15th and 17th Streets, is under the administrative jurisdiction of the District of Columbia. Jackson and Madison Places, and H Street are also under the administrative jurisdiction of the District of Columbia. Lafayette Park, including the sidewalks that surround it, the White House grounds and the sidewalk in front of the White House are under the jurisdiction of the National Park Service. The sidewalks on both sides of the street on either end of Pennsylvania Avenue, and those across from Lafayette Park on Jackson and Madison Places are the maintenance responsibility of either the Treasury Department or General Services Administration.

Project Description

The preliminary site and building plans addresses security components, landscape treatment and site furnishings, and pedestrian and vehicular circulation. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figure 3*)

Security Components

With limited exceptions, access to this secure area will be accommodated at the Jackson and Madison Places checkpoints. The checkpoints on Pennsylvania Avenue will be limited to pre-screened or cleared motorcades, emergency vehicles, and the Downtown Circulator. Security booths and a “sally port” (a secure area formed by two lines of bollards) are proposed to secure each of these four entry points. The “sally port” prevents tailgating vehicles to gain access and allows the security to better control entry.

The security booths will be positioned to allow vehicles to approach the booth on the driver’s side. Fixed bollards will be placed in the sidewalks, except where there is a need to allow for the passage of vehicles or maintenance equipment. Removable bollards will be used in locations where there will be an infrequent need to remove the barrier, such as for the Inaugural Parade, and retractable bollards will be used where frequent passage is required.

- **Jackson and Madison Places**
(*Refer to Attachment I, Figures 4 and 5*)

The proposed security improvements at Jackson and Madison Places include creation of a “sally port,” removal of street bollards, and relocation and replacement of the security booths. The location of the security booth and security line on Madison Place will remain within 5 feet of its present location. The security line and the security booth on Jackson Place will be relocated approximately 40 feet north. In both cases, these barrier lines will consist of a combination of fixed and retractable bollards, the first barrier line will be placed at least 100 feet south of the intersection of H Street, with a second bollard line installed 44 feet to 48 feet south to create the

“sally port.” Vehicles will be inspected and cleared outside of the first bollard line prior to entering into the “sally port.”

Both the outer and inner bollard lines will extend from the row house facades and will cross the sidewalk and street, and tie into the existing bollard line in Lafayette Park. The existing temporary security booths installed in 1999 will be replaced with newly designed booths that will be located inside the new bollard line. The security booths will sit on an extended sidewalk positioned to channel vehicles as they enter or exit the secure area, providing approximately 24 feet for two-way circulation. The security booth on Jackson Place will be located just south of the Van Steuben Statue plaza area, and on Madison Place, just south of, and across the street from, the Kosciuszko Statue plaza area.

- Pennsylvania Avenue at 15th and 17th Streets
(Refer to Attachment I, Figures 6 and 7)

The proposed security improvements at 15th and 17th Streets on Pennsylvania Avenue include relocation and replacement of the security booths, relocation of the security lines and creation of a sally port,” and removal of sidewalk bollards. The Pennsylvania Avenue entrances are proposed to serve vehicular traffic limited to emergency vehicles, pre-screened vehicles and motorcades, and the Downtown Circulator. Therefore, the security booths will be located inside the “sally port,” and cueing requirements outside the “sally port” will be minimal. Redesigned to be architecturally appropriate, the security booths will be placed on the south side of Pennsylvania Avenue and positioned so that vehicles approach the booths on the driver’s side. The existing barrier line of planters and hydraulic plate barriers will be removed and a dual barrier line consisting of a combination of fixed, removable, and retractable bollards will be installed. The existing barrier lines will be relocated outward toward the intersections, and a second, inner barrier line installed to form the “sally port.” The new outer bollard lines will be located between 30 and 40 feet from the face of the intersections to allow one car to cue and at least 10 feet of unencumbered area for pedestrians to pass.

17th Street

At 17th Street, the security line stand-off distance has been increased by 72 feet. A new outer bollard line will be located 40 feet from the intersection of 17th Street, and the existing barrier line will move east 12 feet to become the inner bollard line, creating an 86-foot “sally port.” The bollard lines will extend from the Renwick fence to the EEOB fence across Pennsylvania Avenue. A kiosk will be hardened and used to secure the area along the north side of the EEOB fence between the bollard line on Pennsylvania Avenue and the existing bollards along the curb of 17th Street west of the BEOB. The proposed design modifies the approved EEOB 17th Street bollard line and its interface with the proposed Pennsylvania Avenue bollard line.

15th Street

At 15th Street, the stand-off distance has been increased by 200 feet. A new outer bollard line will be located 30 feet from the intersection of 15th Street, and the existing barrier line

will move 116 feet east from the inner bollard line, creating a 79-foot “sally port.” The bollard lines will extend from the Treasury fence across Pennsylvania Avenue, to the curb line just west of Riggs’s Bank entry, and will be off set 23 feet to the west where it will continue to cross the sidewalk to the building. Hardened benches are proposed to be placed within the 23-foot gap, parallel to the sidewalk in front of the bank, to form a continuous security barrier.

Urban Design

The proposed design removes the numerous planter pots at the entry thresholds and maintains the curb lines and width of Pennsylvania Avenue. Multiple vehicular routes and two-way circulation is provided along all roadways and at each security checkpoint to accommodate maximum flexibility for presidential or head-of-state motorcades, emergency vehicles, and the Downtown Circulator. A clear distance of at least 60 feet is maintained between the north curb line and the security booths on Pennsylvania Avenue to accommodate the Inaugural Parade and other ceremonial events, allowing the security booths to stay in place during these events.

- *Circulator.* Multiple routes for the proposed Downtown Circulator are accommodated. The Downtown Circulator could traverse between 15th and 17th Street either via a direct route along the Avenue or an alternate route south on Jackson Place, east along Pennsylvania Avenue, and north on Madison Place.

Insert circulation graphics

- *Cartway.* The Avenue and adjoining sidewalks will be re-graded to remove the crown of the existing roadway to create a gentle sloping surface. It will slope from the park (north sidewalk) up toward the White House (south sidewalk). (Refer to Attachment I, Figure 8)

- *Tree Planting.* All trees currently located along the length of Pennsylvania Avenue will be removed. A new planting scheme is proposed, consisting of 22-foot to 24-foot tall, 6-inch to 8-inch caliper, American Elms. Overall, the spacing of the trees will replicate the 32-foot spacing depicted in the Frederick Law Olmstead's 1935 report that identified existing tree plantings. The proposed planting scheme consists of: (1) a single row of street trees along the north and south curbs of Pennsylvania Avenue between Jackson and Madison Places, excluding a 180-foot opening on each sidewalk in front of the White House; (2) a double row of trees along the south curb of Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the EEOB and the Treasury Department; and, (3) a single row of trees along the north curb line of the Avenue west of Jackson Place and east of Madison Place, excluding the frontage along the Renwick Gallery and Riggs Bank. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figures 3 and 9*)
- *Granite Paving.* The eastern and western ends of Pennsylvania Avenue will be paved with 2' x 5' granite slabs in the cartway and 4' x 10' granite slabs within the sidewalk area. The 4' x 10' granite will continue along the length of the south sidewalk in front of the White House. Three warm-toned granites, having a mix of gray and pink tones, are proposed. The darkest granite color will be used in the cartway along the length of the curb to visually reinforce this edge. The pavement modules will be stacked, aligned to form continuous joints. The long side of the granite will be placed parallel to the curb line to reinforce the axis of the Avenue and to accentuate these areas as entryways to the precinct. Granite paving will also be used in the extended sidewalks where the booths will be placed on Jackson and Madison Places. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figure 10.*)
- *Aggregate Paving.* The central portion of the Avenue, in front of the White House, and the full lengths of Jackson and Madison Places will be paved with a durable, stabilized pavement with an aggregate stone finish. The color of the aggregate mix will be compatible with the color of the granite but contrasted with a range of brown and pink tones. It will be constructed to withstand the structural requirements of the various uses and accommodate pedestrian and handicap users. Actual pavement design has not yet been completed or submitted for review. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figures 10*)

Site Furniture

- *Lighting.* All of the existing light fixtures along the length of Pennsylvania Avenue will be replaced with Washington D.C. twin-headed lamps designed by Henry Bacon. They will be painted light gray-green to match their original color. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figure 11*)
- *Benches.* A series of slender granite benches, of the same granite as the paving, are proposed to be placed either individually or in pairs within the bosque of trees in front of the EEOB and Treasury Department, and in front of Riggs Bank. Currently, there are no benches proposed in front of Blair House and the Renwick Gallery. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figure 12*)
- *Trash Receptacles.* Currently, there are no trash receptacles proposed along the Avenue.

Security Elements

- *Booths.* The security booths at each checkpoint are proposed to be the same design, they are approximately 8 feet by 12.5 feet. In all cases they will be positioned with their slender facades parallel to the cartway. The design of the booth reflects the classical architecture found along the Avenue, yet it is more modern in style because the proportion of glass to stone and metal is more contemporary and the lines and detailing are clean and simple. Currently, the booths have a granite base, cast iron columns, and a metal seam roof. The material and detailing of the roof is still being evaluated. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figure 13*)
- *Pennsylvania Avenue Bollards.* A new bollard design is proposed for the White House on Pennsylvania Avenue at 15th and 17th Streets. The fixed and removable Pennsylvania Avenue bollards that cross the Avenue are 36 inches high, simple lined and have an oval cross-section with a fluted exterior similar to that of the Presidential bollard. These bollards reflect a stripped classicism style commonly found in projects of the twentieth century. The color of these bollards will match the gray-green light fixtures that currently exist on the Avenue. A similar design is proposed for the retractable bollard; however it will be round in cross-section to accommodate the mechanics of their movement and to differentiate the entry to the secure space. In this location the retractable bollard will be painted light gray-green to match the color of the Pennsylvania Avenue bollard. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figures 14 and 16*)
- *Jackson and Madison Places Bollards.* The fixed and removable bollards that form the “sally ports” at Jackson Place and Madison Place will match the existing 42” inch high Presidential bollard in shape and color and will tie into the existing bollard lines in Lafayette Park. The same retractable bollard design as used on Pennsylvania Avenue will be used in these locations as well; however, they will be painted the same dark color as the Presidential bollard. (*Refer to Attachment I, Figures 13 and 14*)
- *Removal of Existing Bollards.* The large, pre-cast concrete bollards located along the curb line in front of the White House, the thin, black steel bollards at the south terminus of Jackson Place, and the concrete masonry bollards at the northern terminus of Jackson and Madison Places will be removed as part of the proposed design.

Other Modifications

- *Parking.* The proposed design will result in the removal of 40-angled parking spaces on Jackson Place. Removal of these parking spaces are necessary to accommodate the revised circulation patterns associated with the proposed design.
- *Lafayette Park.* With the limited exception of the southern sidewalk and those locations necessary to tie into the existing bollard line at Jackson and Madison Places, no other portion of Lafayette Park will be disturbed. The brick and granite curbs along the north side of the Avenue (south side of Lafayette Park) that will be removed to re-grade and replant the trees will be stockpiled and reinstalled.

EVALUATION

The visibility, international significance, security requirements, and symbolic importance of the White House and its environs present a significant design challenge. The proposed design addresses this challenge and a number of competing operational requirements in a thoughtful and respectful manner. The proposed security elements, paving materials and site furnishings are of a high quality design that reflects the dignity and importance of this place. The proposal enhances the historic setting and views of the White House, it reflects a clear memory of the Avenue's historic context, and it accommodates the staging of inaugural parades and the proposed Downtown Circulator transit vehicle. In addition, the proposed design is easily reversible and does not preclude the future reopening of the street to vehicular traffic, or the future construction of a tunnel under Pennsylvania Avenue.

Security and Urban Design

- *Security Operations.* The security elements have been located and designed to address the specific needs of the precinct and to complement its character. The design satisfies the physical security and operational requirements by increasing the standoff distance and improving control of vehicles entering the secure precinct in a manner that minimizes the visual impact and disruption of pedestrian movement. Relocating daily activity to Jackson and Madison Places and using Pennsylvania Avenue for official purposes will distribute vehicular circulation patterns.
- *Security Booths.* The security booths will be located to allow the security an unobstructed view of approaching vehicles, and the “sally port” configurations will maximize the guard’s control of entry into the precinct. The intent is not to historicize the booths so they appear to have been part of the precinct historically, but to integrate them into the design so they are contextually appropriate. The proposed materials are of the highest quality and durability, imparting dignity and elegance.

The proposed design, style and materials proposed for the security booths on Pennsylvania Avenue will successfully respect and complement the formal, classical setting and scale of the Avenue and the White House, as well as the “stripped-classicism” of other structures in the area. They will be positioned to respect the formal qualities of the buildings and site and will maintain visual openness along the Avenue. While the perception of the booth’s mass is minimized by stepping back the stone base, carrying the column down in front of the granite base, and incorporating the use of mullions to improve the scale of the windows, the proportions and detailing are still being evaluated. Initially both a gable roof and hipped roof were considered; while the gable roof complements the White House fence piers, the proposed hipped roof reduces the perceived height and formal classicism created by the gable roof, therefore, may be more appropriate at this location.

A more intimate setting exists on Jackson and Madison Places. This setting is created by the ambiance of Lafayette Park, the scale of the buildings and roadway, and use of materials. While the overall design of the booths and the use of stone, cast iron and metal complement

the character of Jackson and Madison Places, the scale and treatment of the materials needs to be evaluated to ensure the scale of the booth is appropriate for these locations. The use of the hipped roof for the booths on Jackson and Madison Places is appropriate where the character is more park-like and it is important to reduce the prominence and visual intrusion of the booths on the landscape and impact on the plaza area containing the Statues.

Since approval of the design concept, the security booth on Jackson Place has been relocated south of the plaza area of the Van Steuben Statue, minimizing the impact to views across Lafayette Park from the Decatur House and the memorial plaque honoring Jacqueline Kennedy's early 1960's contribution to the preservation of Lafayette Park and Square.

Although the preliminary design of the booth respects both Pennsylvania Avenue and Jackson and Madison Places, further study and refinement of the security booth is needed to ensure the proper proportion and use of materials of its base, columns, and roof to reduce the perceived mass of the structure, as well as the booth's impact on views approaching the Avenue and through Lafayette Park. Additionally, the final design must ensure that the roof does not encroach into the travel route of the parade.

- *Bollards.* Bollards are part of the typical palette of streetscape components established in President's Park and are appropriately associated with the control of movement along streets, sidewalks, and the edge of a park. Although the National Capital Urban Design and Security Plan strives to reduce the reliance on bollards as the primary security element, the bollard has been chosen and is considered appropriate at this location for a number of reasons. In addition to continuity, the bollard provides free pedestrian movement, maintains a visually open environment, and respects the character of the street. In this location, the placement of new bollards is relatively limited, and is not perceived to be foreign to this landscape.

While the Presidential bollard and the proposed Pennsylvania Avenue bollard are roughly based on a classical fluted column, the existing Presidential bollard is Victorian in character and was designed and established as a security component in a park-like setting, typically edging grass. It is appropriate in an area such as Lafayette Park. The new bollard design proposed for Pennsylvania Avenue at 15th and 17th Streets is appropriate, the simple lines and flutes reflect stripped classicism and the oval shape reinforces the directionality of the Avenue and conveys a sense of formality and elegance. The Pennsylvania Avenue bollard is contemporary and its scale and light color is more appropriate to this wide avenue. It draws upon the neoclassical post on East Executive Drive next to the Treasury, relating to this authentic President's Park feature.

Although the cap of the removable Pennsylvania Avenue bollard is intended to be virtually flat, it must accommodate a mechanism that will allow it to be hoisted out of the ground. **As this detail continues to be developed, consideration should be given to ensure it properly drains, can be easily maintained and not be improperly used as a seat or stool.**

The mechanics of the retractable bollard require it to have a uniform cross-section, unlike the fixed or removable bollards. To avoid incorporating too many bollard styles within the

precinct, one retractable bollard is proposed to be used in conjunction with the existing Presidential bollard or the newly proposed Pennsylvania Avenue bollard. The new retractable bollard is 36 inches high, round and fluted, it will be painted to match either of the adjoining fixed bollards. The design of the retractable bollard will complement both bollard designs. Additionally when placed with non-operable bollards, the shape of the retractable bollard allows it to be differentiated from the fixed bollards, thereby signaling the entry checkpoint for motorists.

- *Inner bollard, line at 15th Street.* The plan proposes hardened benches to be placed within a 23-foot gap, parallel to the sidewalk in front of the bank, to form a continuous security barrier, as shown in figure 3. This solution was proposed based on concerns that the bollard line would intersect with the doorway and entry at Riggs Bank. After obtaining survey information and further study it was determined that the inner bollard line will align with the column on the west side of the doorway at the bottom of the entry stairway. Additionally, the benches, as proposed do not satisfy minimum security requirements. To meet the security performance standard they would have to be redesigned and of a size that would not be appropriate for this location. Therefore, **the applicant is recommending that the barrier line be revised to extend from the Treasury fence across Pennsylvania Avenue to the steps, aligning it with the inside column of the Riggs Bank. Based on these finding, staff supports the designers most current recommendation.**
- *Outer bollard line at 17th Street.* At 17th Street, the proposed Pennsylvania Avenue bollard line will extend across the sidewalk to the EBOB fence, this proposed configuration will modify the existing EEOB 17th Street bollard line. This modification will improve the functional aspects of this corner and be more aesthetically appropriate. To prevent the need to harden the EEOB fence and to provide a transition between the Presidential bollard and the Pennsylvania Avenue bollard, the plan proposes to harden the existing information kiosk and relocate it parallel to the EEOB fence as shown on figure 3. **As currently designed the kiosk is not long enough to secure the distance between the two bollard lines, therefore, this detail will need to be addressed prior to final design.**
- *“Sally Ports”.* The distance between the “sally ports” dual bollard lines is intended to satisfy operational requirements by minimizing interference with the entries and the functional requirements of adjacent buildings (delivery vehicles, motorcades, and emergency vehicles). This distance also prevents the perception of two bollard lines from visually converging and creating the perception of a wall, thereby maintaining a visually accessible and open environment. Although the “sally port” allows pedestrian access and can accommodate daily activities, such as truck deliveries and customer drop-off, the location of the outer bollard lines restricts access. Therefore, operational procedures will need to be established to address these requirements.

For example, the Renwick Gallery, Riggs Bank and White House Historical Association require unencumbered pedestrian access as well as the ability to accommodate deliveries, customer drop-off, and special events. The typical delivery truck that services the

Renwick Gallery is 48 feet in length, it must be able to enter, unload and exit the “sally port”. To accomplish this, the Renwick Gallery and United States Secret Service must coordinate the logistics of this delivery.

Additionally, during times of heightened security, bike racks have been temporarily placed to control pedestrian access at various points along the Avenue and in Lafayette Park. The United States Secret Service has agreed to place any temporary pedestrian barriers at the inner bollard line so as not to restrict pedestrian access.

Currently there are four white masonry bollards at the northern terminus of both Jackson and Madison Places at H Street. These bollards are visually intrusive and distract from the quality of the Park. **Since a “sally port” will be created at Jackson and Madison Places, staff recommends removal of the white masonry bollards to reduce the number of elements and visual impact on Lafayette Park.**

Circulation and Urban Design

The proposed design creates a pedestrian precinct, accommodating the important functions that occur within the area and securing it for the protection of the President and the President’s family and staff.

- *Reversibility.* The plan is simple and flexible and can be easily retrofitted to accommodate a vehicular thoroughfare, or modified to accommodate a higher intensity of programmed people oriented space, as may be deemed appropriate in the future. If and when the security threat changes or technologies improve to allow high volumes of traffic on the Avenue, only the security booths and bollards would need to be removed. All landscape planting and streetscape elements are located outside of the 84-foot right-of-way; therefore, these features would not be disturbed or negatively impacted by any change in roadway use.
- *Emergency Access.* Emergency access is accommodated at each of the four security checkpoints.
- *Pedestrian Activity.* Pedestrian access is significantly improved by removing the bollards from the sidewalk in front of the White House, and removing the numerous planter pots and small trees from the cartway. The area in front of the White House is flexible and will accommodate formal and informal public gatherings. While the entire Avenue can accommodate free movement of pedestrians, the openness of the area in front of the White House, between Jackson and Madison Places, creates a grand and dignified memorial place to view the office and home of the President, and conduct public activities.
- *Vehicle Cueing.* H Street is a one-way eastbound roadway, and ample cueing areas are provided on Jackson and Madison Places. At each of these locations, up to five cars or two, 45-foot trucks, can be accommodated before entering the “sally port,” and an additional two cars or one mid-size (40-foot) truck can be processed within the “sally port” simultaneously.

On Pennsylvania Avenue the barrier lines are being relocated outward toward the 15th Street and 17th Street intersections. Although access through these checkpoints will be restricted, room for pedestrians to safely pass a vehicle that is cued outside the barrier line is needed. The distance provided to allow one car to cue and room for pedestrians to pass is 30 feet at 15th Street allowing 10 feet clear pedestrian passage, and 40 feet at 17th Street allowing 20 feet clear pedestrian passage.

- *Downtown Circulator.* Multiple routes for the proposed Downtown Circulator are accommodated without detracting from the pedestrian character of the Avenue. The Circulator could traverse the Avenue between 15th and 17th Streets, either via a direct route along Pennsylvania Avenue, or an alternative route south on Jackson Place, east along Pennsylvania Avenue, and north on Madison Place. The Circulator, a supplement to the downtown transit system, is an important component to re-establish limited cross town connectivity.
- *Ceremonial Events.* The proposed design accommodates the Inaugural Parade and other ceremonial events. A minimum clear distance of 60 feet is required between the overhang of the security booths and the north curb line to accommodate the Parade; compliance with this criteria must be confirmed as final design of the security booths proceeds. This distance allows the security booths to stay in place during preparation for and during these special events. The proposed placement of trees will allow construction of the viewing stands along the Avenue as well. The placement of the booths on Jackson and Madison Places will allow the necessary access requirements for staging and emergency access. However, the addition of the “sally port” on Madison Place will cause a loss of approximately 50 feet of media staging area for the Parade.
- *Official Use.* The official functions of the White House and Blair House are accommodated. The two-way circulation pattern at each of the four security checkpoints allows multiple routes in and out of the precinct for Presidential and Head of State motorcades. Additionally, ample unencumbered cueing area and parking for motorcades can be accommodated on Pennsylvania Avenue during special events.
- *Deliveries.* The loading and delivery functions of the adjacent uses are accommodated. The “sally ports” can accommodate the screening of delivery trucks before they proceed to their destination. Loading and by-pass lanes are also accommodated within the “sally ports” to serve adjacent uses. Operational procedures will need to be established to accommodate intermittent special deliveries by trucks greater than 40 feet in length.
- *Parking.* In addition to being a goal of the President’s Park Comprehensive Design Plan, the removal of the 40-angled parking spaces on Jackson Place is necessary to accommodate adequate circulation and loading functions. It will also enhance the pedestrian experience and quality of this place.

Pedestrian Experience and Visual Quality

The design uses paving materials, tree planting, and street furniture to enhance the pedestrian experience of this space. The design employs familiar materials and mediates between the European formality of the L'Enfant Plan, the naturalism of Downing's Lafayette Park and the open setting of the White House grounds. It maintains consistency with the grace of Lafayette Park and the White House, and respects the open character of the Avenue and historic L'Enfant views of the White House, reinforcing the White House as the focus of President's Park. While the Avenue will not appear as an open street for automobiles, the views that signify the importance and significance of the place will be maintained.

- *Granite Paving.* Large rectangular granite pavers are proposed at the entry portals on Pennsylvania Avenue near 15th and 17th Streets. The pavers will reflect the grand scale and urbanity of the adjacent buildings and accentuate the entryways to the special precinct. The use of large granite pavers for the 33-foot-wide sidewalk in front of the White House provides continuity along the Avenue and creates a dignified and elegant edge to the existing fence and front lawn of the White House. **Additional study and design development is required to ensure: (1) the curb lines along the granite cart-way and handicap ramps are well delineated for both pedestrian safety and to reinforce the historic curb line of the Avenue; and, (2) the colors of the sidewalk complement the plinth walls and various buildings along the Avenue.**
- *Aggregate Paving.* The heart of the space is reinforced through the use of a perceptually softer, more natural paving material. The central portion of Pennsylvania Avenue, and the full lengths of Jackson and Madison Places are spatially connected through the use of a durable, stabilized, aggregate pavement, strengthening its historical relationship to President's Park. This pavement material encourages the pedestrian to slow down, stroll, and reflect on the significance of the place. **As final design proceeds, refinement to the paving material selection and construction technology is needed to: (1) satisfy structural support requirements; (2) provide the desired surface appearance and texture; and, (3) ensure the aggregate color complements the granite and brick and reinforces the spatial quality and relationship of the open lawn of the White House grounds and Lafayette Park.**
- *Trees.* The American elm is proposed for the Avenue tree, it has a beautiful upright and spreading form and proven successful in urban conditions. It is reasonably fast growing and long-lived provided it is well maintained. Although the city has lost this tree in the past to Dutch Elm disease, the National Park Service has an excellent maintenance program and success record with the American elm, losing only 1 percent in the D.C. region. Additionally, the proposed source for the elms is from a nursery that has grown them from cuttings, an ideal condition for their long term survivability. It will also be desirable to have a uniform look along the Avenue throughout the seasons. Several other tree species were considered, but ruled out for various reasons, there was not a sufficient quantity of appropriately sized Hackberry's, White Swamp Oaks do not have a proven track record in urban conditions and Zelkova is considerably over used in the District.

The proposed tree planting scheme is important to the overall success of the design. The bosque of trees on the south side of cartway that forms an allee will de-emphasize the imposition of the security elements at the entry thresholds, improve the pedestrian scale, and create a sense of entry. The planting of street trees on both the north and south side of the cartway strengthens the memory of the street, reinforces the visual axis along the length of the Avenue, and provides a transition to the heart of the space. The absence of trees in front of the White House will emphasize the expansive open area, and differentiate and signify the importance of the place, as well as frame the historic vista from 16th Street that was established in the L'Enfant Plan, emphasizing the sightlines toward the White House and its grounds.

Since concept design approval, the tree spacing in front of the EEOB and Treasury has been refined to provide visual access to the buildings and frame their entries. In front of the White House, the tree spacing has been modified to strengthen the openness in the heart of the space and accommodate gracious views from 16th Street to the White House and its grounds. **Although the location and spacing of the trees has been improved to frame entries and minimize the visual prevalence of the bollards, refinement to the placement of the trees in relation to the built features is needed.**

Additionally, after further study, the applicant has recommended modifying the tree planting scheme on the north side of the Avenue by eliminating three trees in front of Riggs Bank and two trees in front of the Renwick Gallery based on the following rational: (1) these two buildings are architecturally distinguished from the other buildings on the north side of the Avenue; (2) these buildings frame the visual terminus of New York Avenue from the east and Pennsylvania Avenue from the west, giving them a role of land marking the entries to the three-block precinct of Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House; (3) holding back the tree lines will emphasize these buildings role in articulating these corners as special urban landmarks, where the city meets the precinct of the White House; (4) these are the only two buildings that are not related directly to government offices on this portion of the Avenue and their histories, (therefore, the location and design of the buildings), speak to this relationship; and (5) the combination of the security lines, underground utilities and building entry locations prevents the ability to appropriately locate or space the trees, causing them to seem disconnected from the overall planting scheme and compromising the design. **Staff has reviewed the proposal and concurs with the design modification based on the stated rational, in conjunction with the particular conditions of the site and the overall proposed landscape design.**

Preservation of the Historic Character and Integrity of President's Park

The concept design retains the width and the curbs of the Pennsylvania Avenue cartway, and therefore the integrity of the dimensions of the historic street, which has been designated as part of the historic street plan of Washington, DC (known as the L'Enfant Plan). This two-block length of Pennsylvania Avenue did not exist on paper in L'Enfant's Plan, but it existed informally in physical fact beginning in the first years of the occupation of the White House and the street was formally named in 1824.

Pennsylvania Avenue in the two blocks in front of the White House has existed at its current width (or very close to it) since the formal adoption of the street in that year. In addition, the boundaries of Lafayette Park were also established in 1824, the year that the Marquis de Lafayette first visited Washington and addressed the public from the square. The square was fenced in the 1850s and the original fence line was confirmed in 1999 when the fence footings were uncovered. Similarly, the boundary of the north lawn of the White House has been established since 1820 when the White House fence was installed (the current fence is a replica of the original fence).

The reintroduction of the street trees on the south sidewalk of Pennsylvania Avenue is a welcome reinforcement to the character of the Avenue as a city street. While the installation of security barriers in the cartway will undoubtedly change the character of the street right-of-way, the proposal to install the street trees and the Bacon light standard underscores the Task Force's and Commission's charge to the designer to retain the character—the memory—of the street while adapting it for new purposes and to ensure that the two-block length remains physically, visually, and symbolically linked to the rest of the city's street plan. The tree lines, including the double segments in front of the EEOB and the Treasury that create an allee, strengthen the east-west axis of the Avenue, counterbalancing the installation of the bollard lines across the width of the Avenue, and their absence in front of the White House strengthens the north-south axis through the site. The allee and the benches reinforce the pedestrian use and qualities of the sidewalk, thereby reinforcing its distinction from the cartway.

The proposed bollard design is very appropriate for use across the width of Pennsylvania Avenue and its sidewalks. It has been designed and scaled for an urban, paved space, as opposed to bollards that are designed to edge parkland or run parallel to sidewalks and curbs. This bollard will become a visual feature of the Avenue and must be commensurate in character, scale, style, color, and dimension with the importance of this public space and the design vocabulary of the Avenue. At the same time, it must become part of the ensemble of street furniture on the Avenue, which must be subordinate to the buildings and views. The bollard design succeeds in both of these requirements and ameliorates their necessary presence.

The security booth design reflects the urban character of the Avenue and is derived from the White House fence piers and other neoclassical vocabulary along the Avenue. The roofs of the security booths will be the only security elements visible from more than the immediately adjacent blocks of Pennsylvania and New York Avenues. The security booth roofs will be seen against the trees of the White House north lawn and the proposed new street trees.

None of the paving materials in the right-of-ways is historic (all date from no earlier than the 1970s), although brick has been used in some of the sidewalks in some periods during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Paving materials in both the cartway and sidewalks have changed over time; granite has been used for the White House sidewalk since 1975.

Jackson and Madison Places have been previously altered for security purposes by the installation of the Northside Barrier project. The design introduces an additional bollard line that will detract from the visual relationship between the historic buildings and the streets and park.

However, the historic width of the streets and the sidewalks is retained, so that the buildings will continue to address the public space as they have for almost two hundred years. Further, the existing bollard line will be simplified and better integrated with the design and placement of the new security booths. The removal of one or more of the white masonry bollards at the intersections of Jackson and Madison with H Streets will improve the views into the site, as they are the most visible security features from the northern perimeter of Lafayette Park.

PREVIOUS COMMISSION ACTION

- On March 12, 2003, the Commission adopted the concept design plans for the security and landscape project for Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House, and Jackson and Madison Places.
- On January 9, 2003, the Commission adopted plans to install Presidential bollards along the curb line of 17th Street on the west side of the Eisenhower Executive Office Building. The bollards will extend from 17th Street and State Place on the south to 17th Street and Pennsylvania Avenue on the north. At the time the Commission approved the proposal, it was approved “with the understanding that the placement and locations of bollards at the intersection of 17th Street and Pennsylvania Avenue will be modified in the future to be compatible with the plan for security improvements along the section of Pennsylvania Avenue between 15th and 17th Streets.”
- On October 2, 2002, the Commission adopted the National Capital Urban Design and Security Plan that included the selection of Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates as the design firm to design the civic improvements and security measures for Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House.
- On November 2, 2001, the Commission adopted the recommendations of the Interagency Security Task Force and released the report “Designing for Security in the Nation’s Capital.” The report acknowledged that as a result of the terrorist threats since the early 1990s, Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House should be closed to regular vehicular traffic until such time as detection technology improved, or the security threat changed. It also called for immediate action to beautify and improve the condition of this important civic space. It also set forth a number of programmatic criteria necessary to mitigate the impact of its closure.
- On July 9, 1998, the Commission approved final site and building plans for the Northside Barrier Replacement around Lafayette Park and Jackson and Madison Places, NW. On April 2, 1998, the Commission commented on the EA for the Northside Barrier Replacement project.
- On June 19, 1997, the Commission commented on the EA for the implementation of White House Security Recommendations on Vehicular Traffic Restrictions submitted by the Department of the Treasury. The Department of Treasury subsequently issued a Finding of

No Significant Impact (FONSI) and concluded its environmental review of traffic restrictions in the vicinity of the White House.

- On June 27, 1996, the Commission tabled the Alternative Design concepts for Street Improvements along Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, between 15th and 17th Streets until such time as a NEPA document addressing traffic, economic impacts, and historic preservation was prepared by the U.S. Department of Treasury and forwarded by the NPS to the Commission.

RESPONSE TO PREVIOUS COMMISSION ACTION

In conjunction with approval of the concept plan for the Pennsylvania Avenue Security and Landscape Project on March 12, 2003, the Commission requested that the concept design be further developed to respect the need for security and the need to achieve the highest urban design quality. The four issues raised in the Commission Action of March 12, and the design response to each area as follows:

- (1) Determine if there should be demarcation of the pavement to delineate the pedestrian movement and vehicular travel, including the Circulator, within the precinct.
 - The proposed design uses pavement module size, pavement color differentiation, and tree planting to distinguish the cartway from sidewalk and to emphasize the curb line to delineate pedestrian movement. Vehicular travel through the checkpoints is delineated by use of a round retractable bollard that is distinguished from the Presidential bollard and Pennsylvania Avenue bollard. No distinct pavement markings are proposed to route vehicles through the precinct or to delineate the circulator route. Therefore, operational procedures will need to address travel route and speed through the precinct.
- (2) Evaluate the setback of the outer bollard lines on 15th and 17th streets to accommodate cueing of vehicles and a drop-off location without interfering with pedestrian crosswalks.
 - The bollard lines have been adjusted to accommodate cueing of a vehicle and pedestrian by-pass within designated crosswalks. The new outer bollard lines will be located between 30 and 40 feet from the face of the intersections (9 feet and 18 feet from the inside edge of the cross walk) to allow one car to cue and at least 10 feet of unencumbered area for pedestrians to pass.
- (3) Ensure that historic and significant views and settings in this precinct are protected and enhanced to the maximum extent possible.
 - The bollard line locations have also been refined to unobtrusively tie into the existing bollard lines or other adjoining structures to the degree possible, and to recede into the landscape to ensure that visual impacts are minimal. The location of the security booths and the bollard lines on Jackson and Madison Places have been relocated to minimize the impact on the Revolutionary War statues at the corners of Lafayette Park on H Street, and the views into

Lafayette Park. Additionally, a 180-foot spacing has been maintained in the tree planting scheme in front of the White House.

- (4) Define the pavement structure to provide the desired surface appearance and texture, while also satisfying structural support requirements.
- The Federal Highway Administration and design team are continuing to evaluate the aggregate pavement structure and finish to meet structural requirements and provide the desired surface appearance and texture.

CONSULTATION

Multiple entities have been consulted throughout the planning and design development process for Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House. The primary efforts are listed in reverse chronological order.

- *NEPA and Section 106 Consultation Meetings.* On April 26, 2003, the Federal Highway Administration initiated a 30-day public comment period on the environmental assessment in conjunction with the NEPA process. On May 5, 2003, the Federal Highway Administration, in conjunction with NCPC, held a NEPA and Section 106 public meeting to solicit input on the concept design and receive public comment, and on May 19, 2003, a public consultation meeting was held to review and discuss the project and any potential effects on historic resources. The 30-day comment period closed on May 25, 2003.

On February 25, 2003, the Federal Highway Administration, in conjunction with NCPC, held a public consultation meeting to review and discuss the project and any potential effects on historic resources.

On January 15, 2003, the Federal Highway Administration, in conjunction with NCPC, held the initial NEPA and Section 106 public open house. The purpose of this meeting was to solicit additional input from the public regarding design considerations for Pennsylvania Avenue.

- *Verification Study.* Between October 2002 and January 2003, Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates conducted a verification study that involved meeting with key stakeholders to determine the detailed operational and functional requirements for the project. The designer also met with a group of noted historians and architects to obtain input regarding historic resources and urban design.
- *Public Comment on Initial Design Idea.* On September 4, 2002, the NCPC accepted public comment on the National Capital Urban Design and Security Plan (NCUDSP) that included Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates' design idea. On July 11, 2002, the NCPC released the NCUDSP and design idea for a 45-day public comment period.
- *Design Approach Idea Generation.* In February 2002, as part of the NCUDSP, four

landscape architects were asked to submit ideas on how to improve the Avenue in an effort to generate design idea approaches. Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates was chosen as the designer to proceed with the design effort.

- *Reconsideration and review of previous design proposals.* Between March 2001 and September 2001, the Interagency Security Task Force consulted with security, urban design, transportation and historic preservation experts to evaluate and debate the appropriateness of the Avenue's closure. The Security Task Force reached the difficult conclusion that Pennsylvania Avenue should remain closed until the security threat ended. This consensus decision by all Task Force members and key stakeholders, including the U.S. Secret Service, the National Park Service, the Mayor of the District of Columbia, the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, the Federal City Council, and Congresswoman Eleanor Holmes Norton, was reached only after considerable debate and agreement on a number of programmatic requirements.

As part of this evaluation, the Security Task Force conducted a thorough review and deliberation of all previous design proposals prepared for the Avenue. Among design proposals generated over a 40-year period, the reviews also included the National Park Service's Comprehensive Design Plan for President's Park, and the design process used by the National Park Service in 1995 and 1996 for the Avenue. Both of these efforts included extensive input from both national experts and the general public.

Comprehensive Design Plan for the White House and President's Park

The National Park Service, in cooperation with many agencies and entities, including the Commission, developed the Comprehensive Design Plan (CDP) for the White House and President's Park. Approved by the Commission in May 2000, the CDP addresses the physical and functional needs of the White House, the Executive Office of the President, and the president and his family for the next twenty years. Incorporated in the proposed solutions are measures to improve the historic and visual character of President's Park. The CDP addresses resource conservation and protection, White House support services, visitor services, special events, transportation and parking, and site management and operations. The CDP did not address the future plans for Pennsylvania Avenue itself, but did provide for security barriers along H Street at the north of the site; the Northside Barrier project was implemented before the adoption of the CDP.

The CDP recommended the removal of parking on Jackson Place, as well as surface parking throughout the Park, to improve its appearance, function, and security. In the context of the current proposal, the removal of parking spaces and vehicles would allow for adequate area for traffic flow, and loading and deliveries. The CDP calls for the provision of 1,140 parking spaces in several locations below grade within President's Park.

Conformance with the Comprehensive Plan

There are two elements of the National Capital Planning Commission's Comprehensive Plan that most directly apply to the Pennsylvania Avenue Security and Landscape Design Project; these are the Parks, Open Space and Natural Features Element and the Preservation and Historic Features Element. The proposed concept design is consistent with the goals and policies in both elements.

The concept design has met the project's objectives of satisfying both security and circulation requirements and of beautifying and improving the quality of the public space. This has been achieved while acknowledging the historic character and integrity of the L'Enfant and McMillan Plans. The proposed landscape components enhance the public buildings and civic space, and provide a flexible space for public use and gatherings. The security features have been located, to the degree possible, to minimize the impacts to the historic character of the setting.

The Comprehensive Plan encourages that cultural and open space resources--the legacy of the L'Enfant Plan and the McMillan Plans--be conserved through protection and enhancement, and also serve as places for documenting our natural heritage. President's Park, including Lafayette Park, qualifies as a Monumental and Decorative Park, a Designed Landscape, and as a Historic Park in the Parks and Open Space System.

The following policies in the Park, Open Space and Natural Features Element guide the development and protection of these resources:

- The great cross-axes of the Mall Complex, from the Capitol to the Lincoln Memorial and from the White House to the Jefferson Memorial, are a unique national space—they are a summary of democratic ideals and achievements that must be protected from inappropriate development. The Mall should be considered complete, and any improvements necessary in this area should be limited in scope and sensitively designed to reinforce the integrity of the Mall Complex.
- The Mall Complex should primarily serve as a formal setting for the Capitol, the White House, the Washington Monument, the Lincoln Memorial, the Jefferson Memorial, and the Tidal Basin and should be maintained as a large landscaped, open, and ecologically significant area. It should also serve as a heritage education center and meet the passive/leisure and active recreational needs of visitors and residents, to the extent that its primary purpose is not compromised.
- Monumental Parks and Designed Landscapes should serve as settings to enhance public buildings, monuments, and memorials; as such, their fundamental integrity should be protected. They should also serve as outdoor areas for displays and cultural activities, as well as areas for passive and controlled active recreational activities, including lunchtime picnics and gatherings.
- The historic urban design framework of the Nation's Capital established by the L'Enfant and McMillan Plans for open space, long axes, and dramatic vistas must be protected.

- Designed landscape parks (squares, circles, and triangles) associated with the L'Enfant City should be restored, where necessary, protected, and enhanced generally as green landscaped areas providing oases for pedestrians and settings for monuments, memorials, and civic art.
- Historic parks should be established and preserved as important legacies of national historic, architectural, and landscape significance. Special efforts should be taken to provide for the interpretation of their history. Historic parks should be properly maintained to provide for controlled use that respects their historical integrity. Ancillary uses, such as access, visitor, and multi-purpose activities, should not detract from the historical value of these sites.

The Preservation and Historic Features element of the Comprehensive Plan provides further guidance. The goal and objectives include:

- Preserving and enhancing the urban spaces, circles, squares, and plazas generated by the L'Enfant Plan and McMillan Plan and the unique views and vistas of the National Capital;
- Promoting continuity in the planning of the historic design framework of the National Capital as generated by the L'Enfant and McMillan Plans, and protecting their important intangible, as well as tangible qualities such as the setting, system of streets and intended character of development.
- [Preserving] the important Historic Features of the District while permitting new development that is compatible with those features.
- [Increasing] awareness of, and access to, facilities, place, and activities essential to residents and visitors.

The Federal and District governments should cooperatively to:

- Provide leadership in the protection and enhancement of the important Historic Resources of the National Capital.
- Establish and sustain exemplary standards of property stewardship, design, and maintenance for all Historic property under their ownership or control.
- Ensure that records relating to the construction, alteration, and demolition of Historic Properties or potential Historic properties are retained for future use and reference.
- Ensure that actions that affect Historic Properties are reviewed for historic preservation impacts.
- Every effort should be made to provide for the continued, appropriate use of all Historic properties. If the original use or a reasonable intensification of the original use is no longer feasible, appropriate adaptive use. . . should be encouraged.

- The distinguishing qualities or character of Historic Landscapes should be protected and enhanced.
- Within Historic Districts, and particularly within the L'Enfant City, original street patterns should be preserved by maintaining public rights-of-way.
- The distinguishing original quality or character of historic properties should be protected. The removal or alteration of any historically valuable material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible and kept to a minimum when required for continued use.
- New construction on Historic Landmarks or in Historic Districts should be compatible with the historical architectural character and cultural heritage of the landmark or district. In design, height, proportion, mass, configuration, building materials, texture, color, and location, new construction should complement these valuable features of the landmark or district, particularly features in the immediate vicinity to which the new construction will be visually related.

Coordinating Committee

The Coordinating Committee reviewed this item at its meeting on May 14, 2003, and forwarded the proposal to the Commission with the statement that the project has been coordinated with all agencies participating. The participating agencies were NCPC; the District of Columbia Office of Planning; Fire Department; the Department of Housing and Community Development; the District of Columbia Department of Transportation; the General Services Administration; the National Park Service; and the Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority.

National Historic Preservation Act

FHWA is serving as the lead agency for conducting the Section 106 review for this undertaking, in partnership with NCPC. Consultation has been underway in several phases since the Task Force began its work in March 2001, first with federal and District of Columbia agency members of the Task Force, along with advising agencies and invited technical experts. Information derived from NPS's public and agency outreach effort during the development of the Comprehensive Design Plan for President's Park about the future use and appearance of both the Park and the Avenue was taken into consideration, as well. In addition, NCPC staff made presentations to professional groups locally and nationally and solicited responses to the Task Force's work. The Task Force released its report in November 2001, followed by a comment period. The second phase of the collective inquiry culminated in the July 2002 draft *National Capital Urban Design and Security Plan*, which was followed by a 45-day comment period. In addition, the Commission heard public testimony at its July 11, 2002 commission meeting.

In the *National Capital Urban Design and Security Plan*, an initial scheme for design and security modifications to Pennsylvania Avenue in front of the White House was presented.

Throughout Fall 2002, NCPC, FHWA, and the designer met with agencies and adjacent property owners having functional and technical operations in President's Park. As a result of the many operational requirements of the area, and following further site investigation and design development, the current preliminary site and building plan has been developed and is the subject of continuing Section 106 consultation.

The initial NEPA and Section 106 Scoping Meeting was held on January 15, 2003 to brief the public on the project, the initial concept idea, and the review process and timeline. A Section 106 public consultation meeting was held on February 25, 2003 to review the revised concept proposal. A subsequent meeting on May 5, 2003 allowed the public to comment on both NEPA and historic preservation matters during the EA comment period. Another Section 106 consultation meeting was held on May 19, 2003.

FHWA's determination, in consultation with the DC State Historic Preservation Office and other agencies and parties, is that that project will have an *adverse effect* on some of the historic resources in the area, given the installation of bollards and security booths in the rights-of-way and the resulting change to the character of the open space and the views. Other effects may result from the specific placement of the bollard lines, benches, or trees close to building facades or historic fences or railings, as well as from alterations to the site through the change or differentiation of materials. FHWA will continue to seek mitigation of these anticipated and potential adverse effects through the further study of the historic character of the site, through further consultation, and through continuing design refinements of the proposal.

FHWA will prepare a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) that will indicate the design development that has occurred through consultation and study in order to mitigate the adverse effects of the security measures. The MOA will also likely incorporate procedures for continuing review during the remaining design development. In addition, there may be some mitigation measures that are not related to the design process, such as the protection of historic resources from construction impacts and the monitoring of historic buildings for project-related or cumulative effects from construction or changing traffic patterns. The MOA will be prepared for review and consultation during the summer, prior to review by the Commission of final site and building plans this fall.

On May 19, 2003 a Section 106 consultation meeting was held by FHWA and attended by Commission staff and representatives of the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, the Executive Office of the President, the Committee of 100 on the Federal City, the National Coalition to Save Our Mall, the Renwick Gallery, Decatur House and the National Trust for Historic Preservation, the D.C. Society of Professional Engineers, and the U.S. Secret Service.

Parties asked for visual information or simulations showing the appearance of an extended bollard line across the Avenue and a long view showing the change of street material. Additional areas of discussion and/or concern included the possibility of the trees obscuring views of the Renwick Gallery facade, the "unbalanced" second row of trees in front of the EEOB and the Treasury, and the alignment of trees in relation to piers of historic fences on south side of Avenue. The desire for one unified paving material along the length of the Avenue cartway was preferred by some.

The Renwick expressed a desire for the retention of its (non-historic) red sandstone carpet in the sidewalk in front of the building. The alignment of the benches in relation to the fence piers on south side of Avenue was raised. The proposed use of two different styles of bollards (the “Presidential” bollard at H Street and the “Pennsylvania Avenue” bollard on the Avenue) at the site was questioned, as was the appearance of the oval form of the bollard on Pennsylvania Avenue when seen in a row and from oblique angles.

Traffic and vehicle vibration was a concern, particularly for the Decatur House, given its proximity to the proposed increased vehicle use of the Jackson Place entry into the precinct. In addition, the need for information about the reversibility of the alterations to the site, including the cost and time required to restore the street to normal vehicular use and the replacement of materials to a pre-1995 appearance, was discussed.

National Register significance of the setting:

Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House is one of the most historic and symbolically sensitive places in the nation. The White House at 1600 Pennsylvania Avenue lies within President’s Park, a special precinct of the Nation’s Capital. Generous public spaces and views, historic buildings and landscapes, and associations to historical events and people characterize this precinct and tell its history. These settings, buildings, and associations have great significance for the American people.

The landscape design of Lafayette Park by Andrew Jackson Downing, the noted horticulturist and landscape designer, was implemented in the mid-19th century and is still largely intact. Most of the 19th-century buildings along Madison and Jackson Places facing Lafayette Park are now executive branch offices, although they were originally private dwellings. Similarly, the buildings on the north side of Pennsylvania Avenue, such as the Smithsonian Institution’s Renwick Gallery, Blair House, and Riggs Bank, reflect earlier private development near the White House. Lafayette Park is the centerpiece of the Lafayette Square Historic District, designated a National Historic Landmark in 1970. The historic district contains approximately thirty buildings, including the Eisenhower Executive Office Building and the Treasury Building flanking the White House. Most of the buildings in the Lafayette Square Historic District are also individually designated in the National Register of Historic Places. The 15th Street Financial Historic District and the Pennsylvania Avenue National Historic Site are other designations that document the area’s significance.

As in other parts of Washington, and particularly in President’s Park, open space—including the street rights-of-way and parkland—is as significant to the historic setting and as worthy of protection as the buildings. The views and vistas along Pennsylvania Avenue, as well as to and from the avenues radiating from the White House, are significant. The avenues provide vantage points from which to view the White House and nearby buildings, and they also comprise an important aspect of the setting of the White House.

National Environmental Policy Act

Pursuant to the regulations implementing the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA), the FHWA, as the responsible federal agency for the proposal, has prepared an Environmental Assessment (EA) for the proposed project plans.

The FHWA has identified the Commission as a cooperating agency in the preparation process for the NEPA document as specified in CEQ guidance issued at 48 Fed. Reg. 34264 (1983) concerning the joint use of NEPA documents, and reflects the cooperative status of NCPC as required by 40 CFR 1501.5, 1501.6 and CEQ guidance issued September 25, 2000.

The EA reviews three alternatives for developing security measures and physical modifications at Pennsylvania Avenue as follows:

- A Preferred Build Alternative;
- A variation of the Build Alternative, known as the MVVA 2002 Alternative;
- The No Build Alternative (alternative specified as a requirement by NEPA).

Additionally, several other alternatives have been reviewed and considered by staff in examination of the EA, as presented by FHWA in the document. A final determination of the potential environmental effects to Pennsylvania Avenue and its adjacent areas, was completed by the FHWA in late May 2003, and approved in a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) by the Region Engineer of the Eastern Federal Lands Highway Division. NCPC staff adopted the EA, in accordance with Commission procedures, with the Executive Director concluding a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI).

The two build alternatives are intended to fulfill the security objectives of the White House Secret Service to protect the Presidential residence, associated office space, and visiting dignitary accommodations and improve the current conditions of the Avenue, which restrict views and pedestrian movement while marring the beauty and dignity of this important place in the Nation's Capital. These conditions were created as a result of hastily installed emergency security measures in 1995.

The alternatives presented in the EA include:

- **MVVA 2002 Alternative.** The design firm of Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates initially proposed a project plan with additional physical features located on the north side of Pennsylvania Avenue. This plan includes a dedicated lane for vehicles, demarcated by a curb on either side, and a row of trees mirroring the historic tree row at the south side of Lafayette Park. The intention of this scheme was to provide a secured set of travel lanes for a proposed Downtown Circulator vehicle passing by in front of the White House. The proposal also limits on-site vehicles to dedicated lanes within the precinct. The proposed row of trees at the north side of the existing roadway was intended to further define the dedicated vehicle travel areas and pedestrian areas. Other elements in the plan included replacement of the existing temporary security booths, installed in 1999, which would be relocated with new

architecturally appropriate booths. The security booths in this plan are proposed to be situated at the sidewalk areas of Pennsylvania Avenue with a barrier system emanating from their location.

- **Preferred Build Alternative.** This plan is a revised variation of the MVVA 2002 design that includes elements to address security operations, landscape treatment, pedestrian use, and vehicular circulation, but further incorporate considerations of adjacent uses, visual appearance, and historic characteristics of buildings along the Pennsylvania Avenue segment and at Madison and Jackson Place. It also includes conceptual recommendations for lighting and paving materials. In conjunction with this alternative plan, daily security operations will be relocated to the Jackson and Madison Places with newly designed security guardhouses. The checkpoints on Pennsylvania Avenue will be limited to pre-screened or cleared motorcades, emergency equipment, and the Downtown Circulator. Security booths and a “sally port” (a secure area formed by two lines of bollards) are proposed to protect each of the four entry points to the Avenue area. The security stations will be positioned to allow vehicles to approach the booth on the driver’s side. Fixed bollards will be placed in the sidewalks, except where there is a need to allow for the passage of vehicles, maintenance equipment, or loading services. Removable bollards will be used in locations where there will be an infrequent need to remove the barrier, such as for the Inaugural Parade. Retractable bollards will be used where frequent passage is required.
- **The No Build Alternative.** This option would retain the existing structures, and other streetscape elements of the current Pennsylvania Avenue area at the White House in their present use and condition. There would be no new development or reconfiguration of facilities. Specifically, the No Build Alternative does not involve a return to any condition of unrestricted public vehicle traffic to the Avenue but involves the continued use of existing temporary measures for White House security, visitor screening and access, and vehicle barriers. The existing security measures would remain. On Pennsylvania Avenue between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, there would be the continued use of large concrete planters on the streets and across the sidewalks, hydraulic plate barriers, and security booths restricting vehicular traffic and pedestrian movement. The bollards, hydraulic barriers and security booths on Jackson and Madison Place at H Street would also remain.

Other alternatives reviewed by staff in the EA included:

- **The Balmori Associates Plan.** This plan involved the same portion of Pennsylvania Avenue but is a project plan to slightly grade and elevate an area of the Avenue adjacent to the White House. The design included a rhythmic grouping of urban furniture and selective lighting that magnifies an atmosphere of civility in a more modern architectural theme. Pennsylvania Avenue by the White House would have become a pedestrian boulevard slightly with changes in the elevation of the street area.
- **The EDAW Plan.** This plan was a more formalized arrangement of design features to integrate Lafayette Park with the White House Grounds and create a single public strolling space. This design, developed from an original sketch by Thomas Jefferson, creates universally accessible strolling, seating, and sightseeing spaces along the Avenue. Double

allees of great American elms are proposed in the plan to line the Avenue and continuous benches, lighting, signage, and paving patterns are identified in the scheme to enliven and furnish the area.

- Peter Walker and Associates Plan. This plan proposes a large-scale granite-plank paving surface at the cartway of the Avenue, framed by carved granite curbs and brick sidewalks.. Two low circular fountains are proposed within the street to combine visually with the existing White House garden fountain. The plan illustrates an effort to ensure that the White House Garden and Lafayette Park are integrated and contribute in the street renovation rather than border it Ten circles composed of hedges, benches, and flowers were suggested to enliven the expanse of pavement in the street.
- The United States Department of the Interior, National Park Service (NPS) performed an Environmental Assessment for the Long-Term design of Pennsylvania Avenue between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, on the north side of the White House, in May 1996. In the NPS EA (*Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House — President's Park*), five alternatives, including a preferred alternative, were addressed in that EA. They were based on more than 700 ideas, suggestions, and survey responses from the public, design professionals, and students, as well as on ideas generated at a design workshop. The 1996 EA proposed the NPS Preferred Alternative concept in which Pennsylvania Avenue would have been realigned in a slight curve to the north to better connect Lafayette Park with the White House and to unify President's Park.

The EA presents the conclusion of the Security Task Force that the other reviewed alternatives for a modified design of Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House do not meet or achieve the objectives of the purpose of the project. Consequently, those alternatives were eliminated in the EA from further detailed analysis.

The EA was made available to the public on April 25, 2003, and the document and project were discussed in a public meeting sponsored by the FHWA on May 5, 2003.

The proposed action specified for implementation by FHWA is the Preferred Build Alternative as identified in the EA comparative matrix. The Commission staff has reviewed the EA analysis and concludes the environmental effects for Preferred Build Alternative have minimal impacts on environmental attributes of the immediate Pennsylvania Avenue area between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, and H Street, Jackson and Madison Places, NW. Moreover, the Preferred Build Alternative has no significant impact to the White House or its operations.

Important visual effects are essential in comparing the alternatives evaluated. Both the potential historic and visual effects are identified in the EA to be further reviewed and coordinated during the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA), Section 106 process. All Section 106 design concerns will be addressed through final project design mitigation actions as determined in a completed Memorandum of Agreement pursuant to the Section 106 process.

NCPC staff has determined the proposed project review and approval does not require an environmental impact statement, because no environmental resources are significantly impacted

by either the intensity of the action or its context. This means that the consequences of the project were analyzed relative to several circumstances as a whole (both human and natural environment), the affected interests, and the proposal's, local and cumulative effects. Additionally, the potential intensity of any effect was examined by NCPC staff including:

- The relocation of the existing bollard line on Jackson Place, and creation of a “sally port” on both Jackson and Madison Places and Pennsylvania Avenue between 15th and 17th Streets, NW. While, the existing bollard line on Madison Place will remain in its present location, the existing bollard line on Jackson Place will be relocated north. In both cases, these barrier lines will consist of a combination of fixed and hydraulic retractable bollards, and will be placed 88 feet south of the intersection of H Street, with a second bollard line installed 64 feet further south to create a secure “sally port”. Vehicles will be inspected and cleared outside of the first bollard line prior to entering into the “sally port.” The “sally port” prevents tailgating and allows the security to control entry. Changes proposed for the project area would not have an adverse impact on pedestrian access to the institutions, agencies, and businesses located within or near the project area; however, the Secret Service may block pedestrian access to the area when the highest level of security is in effect. The new proposed bollard location at Jackson Place is north of the White House Historical Association (WHHA) and, during periods of high security, mitigation will be needed to ensure unobstructed pedestrian access to the WHHA entrance.
- The Preferred Build Alternative construction effects to Lafayette Park that are temporary and which would be minimized. District of Columbia DOT, the U.S. Secret Service, and the National Park Service would complete a maintenance-of-traffic plan for the proposed construction, and any temporary construction closures.
- The effects of the Preferred Build Alternative regarding the re-grading, placement of new trees, and the location of new security guardhouse that would not significantly impact the aesthetic and cultural values of Pennsylvania Avenue. Moreover, these effects will be further reviewed and coordinated in the NHPA Section 106 process that involves consultation with the District of Columbia Historic Preservation Office (DC-SHPO), the ACHP, FHWA, NCPC, and consulting parties. This process will include:
 - FHWA continuing the project's engineering design to ensure that excavation and construction will be conducted without harm to the Avenue's historic resources.
 - Streetscape furnishings, guardhouse structures, pavement materials, lighting, and planting materials that will be of the highest quality and appropriate to the historic precedents of Pennsylvania Avenue.
- Development of the MVVA 2002 Alternative that would have visual impacts from features such as the double row of trees, and additional trees at Lafayette Park. Moreover, features of the proposed Circulator lane median in this alternative would interfere with pedestrian flow, the operations of certain security activities, and the Inaugural Parade route. Because of these qualities, this alternative is incongruent with some of the existing features and envisioned-use of the Avenue as specified by many stakeholders. The MVVA 2002 Alternative would also have a greater visual impact on Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House, resulting from the

larger tree canopy of double rows of trees, and a minor cumulative effect on visual resources in the vicinity of Jackson and Madison Places, the U.S. Treasury Building, and Renwick Gallery.

- In the development of either the MVVA 2002 Alternative or the Preferred Building Alternative, existing tours and interpretive opportunities would continue to be available to the public (within the parameters of national security alert status issued by the Department of Homeland Security and coordinated by the U.S. Secret Service) at the Renwick Gallery, U.S. Treasury Building, Lafayette Park, and the White House. Under all alternatives, the U.S. Secret Service may block pedestrian access to Pennsylvania Avenue at the White House when the highest level of security are in effect during certain circumstances of national security notice, or when visiting Heads of State and dignitaries reside at the Blair House, or in the movements of Presidential motorcades.
- With development of either the MVVA 2002 Alternative or Preferred Build Alternative there are no significant effects contributing to direct or cumulative adverse impacts on water resources, vegetation, hazardous materials, air quality, noise, land use, recreation, or transportation conditions within the Monumental Core or surrounding environs of Pennsylvania Avenue, because none of these attributes are altered from their current condition, use, or presence. General vehicle traffic remains unaltered from the current existing conditions of restricted access to the use of the segment of Pennsylvania Avenue from 15th to 17th Streets, NW. A review of traffic issues and Traffic System Management (TSM) strategies by Commission staff in 2001, which has been made available to the public since its completion in late October of that year, indicates that the E Street, K Street, Pennsylvania Avenue and 14th Street corridors can be improved through signal timing and specified TSM modifications that would place traffic flow above the level of failure.
- Vibration effects potentially associated with the project. There are no FHWA standards for vibration. The Federal Transit Administration (FTA) provides ground-borne vibration impact criteria for various types of building uses (USDOT, 1995). Two categories of vibration criteria apply to the potential issue of vibration effects: they are classified as “human annoyance” and “building damage.”

The information reviewed by staff is taken from the *H Street Vibration Study*, conducted for the Department of the Treasury in 1997 by Parsons Engineering Science. This information was referenced and available in the 1997 EA developed by the Department of Treasury concerning traffic restrictions on the Avenue. The vibration study was performed to determine the potential impact of traffic vibration at historic structures on H Street within the vicinity of Lafayette Square and to present feasible mitigation measures to address potential traffic vibration impact.

The long-term vibration data was found to be consistent with traffic flow in the area. The study noted that information correlated indicated that observed vibration typically represented pulsations generated by buses or trucks traveling over potholes and rough road surfaces. The short-term vibration data indicate that the vibration generated by the traffic in 1997 on H Street exceeded the L_{max} human annoyance criterion of 75dB for frequent events

(more than 70 events per day). Based on both the long-term and short-term measurements, the building damage criterion would not be exceeded at any location.

A moisture and vibration study also was prepared for the Decatur House by the National Trust for Historic Preservation in December of 1994 (NTHP, 1994). That study as well concluded that the major sources of vibration at the Decatur House were bus and heavy truck traffic through the intersection of H Street and Jackson Place.

Based on the evidence of the above information, the staff concludes the Decatur House vibration issue is a pre-existing condition to the contemplated action proposed by FHWA, and that the traffic volume on H Street, NW appears to be the main source of the effect. Nevertheless, because the concern for construction effects of vibration has been expressed, FHWA anticipates monitoring, of construction traffic vibration during the building phase of the project on Jackson Place. Additionally, recommendations for consideration by the District of Columbia DOT, that would serve to reduce the vibration annoyance levels from truck and bus traffic along H Street, could include smoothing the surface of the roadway in the blocks adjacent to the historic structures and replacing the loose manhole covers along the roadway.

- The review of both build alternatives reveals the potential for short-term disruption of utilities. These interruptions would be minimized during construction by appropriate scheduling and phasing. Utilities would also be upgraded, where necessary, during the project construction to reduce long-term maintenance and improve efficiency and operation.
- Other minor effects of the Preferred Build Alternative that are socio-economic effects involving:
 - A loss of staff permit parking.
 - Loading operation revisions on Pennsylvania Avenue for businesses and agencies that must be coordinated with the U.S. Secret Service.
 - A relocated Bollard line to reduce direct effects on Riggs Bank and Renwick Gallery.
 - Trees adjacent to Park, now revised, which potentially caused difficulty with views from the Inaugural Parade viewing stands.
 - Approximately 64 linear feet of media staging area on Madison Place that would be lost for use by media organizations.
- Vehicular traffic which will continue to be restricted, with the exception of the proposed Downtown Circulator that allows for the operation of a secure transit vehicle. The proposed Circulator Route design will need to include appropriate delineation or operational requirements for pedestrian and recreational user safety.

In the context of cumulative impacts, the Preferred Build Alternative would allow for the coordination of plans for the proposed action with the overall goals of *The National Capitol Urban Design and Security Plan*. The total cumulative impacts associated with the proposed action are anticipated to be relatively minor considering the extent of enhancements to the existing Avenue segment. However, impacts associated with historical and cultural resources

may be considered adverse; therefore, they require further review by the District of Columbia Historic Preservation Officer and the Advisory Council On Historic Preservation as provided for under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. The alternative would not prohibit any future plans for the reversibility of Pennsylvania Avenue back to an 84-foot wide traffic thoroughfare. Cumulative effects, during the period of construction, associated with the removal of trees or other vegetation and water quality would not be significant. The proposed action will not preclude or adversely affect planned long-range improvements for the White House complex recommended in *The White House & President's Park —Comprehensive Design Plan* completed by the National Park Service in 1999. The actions proposed for the modification to Pennsylvania Avenue, between 15th and 17th Streets, NW, coincide with the courses of action proposed in that plan.

Mitigation Actions To Be Implemented

Mitigation actions accomplishing the Pennsylvania Avenue modifications are listed below and associated with the resource potentially affected:

Soil resources and Surface Water

In compliance with the District of Columbia Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs permitting regulations, and the *1987 Standards for Soil Erosion and Sediment Control*, erosion and sediment control measures will be implemented to avoid or minimize the potential for sedimentation and contamination impacts to surface waters due to development of the proposed project.

- To reduce the potential for erosion, and to accelerate the reestablishment of vegetation, disturbed areas will be revegetated.
- To further reduce the potential for sedimentation and contamination impacts to surface waters, proposed impervious surface features such as walking paths will be designed to minimize surface area to the extent practicable.

Vegetation Resources

- During construction, heavy equipment will be strictly confined to areas of proposed development limiting the disturbance of vegetation to the minimum necessary to meet project objectives.
- To reduce the potential for erosion, and to accelerate the reestablishment of vegetation, disturbed areas will be revegetated as soon as possible after construction activity is completed. However, certain locations may require delayed implementation due to scheduling of the Inaugural Parade.
- New trees will replace the existing trees along the north and south side of Pennsylvania Avenue in front of buildings, except for the White House. The proposal calls for new trees that are appropriate both historically, and symbolically and which will grow to the proper dimensions, not obstructing views of the Inaugural Parade, businesses or institutions adjacent to Pennsylvania Avenue.

Utilities

Electric, gas, telephone, and water lines under Pennsylvania Avenue would be bored beneath or relocated as necessary during construction of the modifications to Pennsylvania Avenue. There are no major impacts anticipated related to utility relocations beyond those normally incurred doing routine construction projects. Arrangements will be made to coordinate all construction activities with any impacted utility to assure continued uninterrupted service to customers in the project area.

Traffic Effects

Maintenance-of-traffic plans during construction of the project would be prepared for work on each affected street, subject to approval by the District of Columbia Department of Transportation and the U.S. Secret Service. Lane closures for construction would be coordinated to minimize disruption and short-term construction street closures would be scheduled for non-rush hour periods when traffic volumes are lower.

Historic Resources

Pursuant to the Section 106 Review Process, the FHWA will continue to consult with the District of Columbia Historic Preservation Office (DC-SHPO), ACHP, NCPC, and consulting parties.

- FHWA will continue engineering design to ensure that excavation and construction will not damage historic resources.
- The modifications to any historic resources of the area will be installed in a manner that allows it to be reversible with minimum damage to the historic fabric of the structure.
- Ground surfaces and planting materials will be of the highest quality and appropriate to the historic precedents.
- An assessment of additional traffic from construction at Jackson Place and its affect on the Decatur House, if impacts are determined to cause an adverse affect. FHWA would institute operational procedures to reduce any determined effect.